

ASO AC Meeting

5 December 2018

11am UTC

Minutes

| Attendees | Observers | Apologies |
|--|---|---------------------------------------|
| AFRINIC Noah Maina (NM) Omo Oaiya (OO) | APNIC Sunny Chendi (SC) | AFRINIC Fiona Asonga (FA) |
| APNIC Brajesh Jain (BJ) Aftab Siddiqui (AS) - Chair | ARIN Nate Davis (ND) Richard Jimmerson (RJ) Sean Hopkins (SH) | APNIC Henri Kasyfi (HK) |
| ARIN Kevin Blumberg (KB) – Vice Chair Louie Lee (LL) Jason Schiller (JS) | ICANN Carlos Reyes (CR) Akinori Maemura (AM) Ron da Silva (RdS) | LACNIC Hartmut Glaser (HG)* |
| LACNIC Ricardo Patara (RP) – Vice Chair Jorge Villa (JV) | | |
| RIPE NCC Nurani Nimpuno (NN) Filiz Yilmaz (FY) Hervé Clément (HC) | | |
| Secretariat Susannah Gray (SG) – Scribe | | |

* Hartmut Glaser stepped down from the ASO AC on 30 November 2018.

New Action Items from this Meeting

- NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-01: AS to send final proposed text regarding Recommendations #9 and #10 (Chair and Vice Chair roles) to the mailing list on 5 December for a seven-day comment period.
- NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-02: ALL to review the final proposed text regarding Recommendations #9 and #10 (Chair and Vice Chair roles) and be ready to vote at the end of the seven-day comment period (12 December 2018).
- NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-03: AS to send final proposed text regarding Recommendations #16 (Changes to ASO mailing lists) to the mailing list on 5 December for a seven-day comment period.
- NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-04: ALL to review the final proposed text regarding Recommendations #16 (Changes to ASO mailing lists) and be ready to vote at the end of the seven-day comment period (12 December 2018).

- NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-05: HC to further edit the 2018 Work Plan Activity Review and recirculate to the mailing list
 - NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-06: LL to finalize the 2019 ASO AC Work Plan and re-circulate to the mailing list before the next ASO AC Teleconference (9 Jan 2019).
 - NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-07: ALL to review the second draft of the 2019 ASO AC Work Plan and be ready to finalize during the next ASO AC Teleconference (9 Jan 2019).
 - NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-08: AS to send the list of ASO AC Appointments to the mailing list.
-

Agenda

0. Welcome
 1. Roll Call
 2. Agenda Review
 3. Approval of Minutes - November 2018
 4. Open Actions
 5. ASO Review Recommendations 6,7,9 and 10 Status Update
 6. ASO new mailing list implementation plan (Recommendation 16)
 7. 2018 Work Plan Activity Review
 8. 2019 ASO AC Work Plan
 9. Annual Transparency Review
 10. ASO AC Chair Election Schedule.
 11. 2019 ASO AC Teleconference Schedule
 12. 2018 ASO AC Appointments Review
 13. Personal Data on ASO website
 14. Reports
 - a) AFRINIC Meeting
 15. AOB
 - a) ICANN Board Election Status Update (No ICANN Board members in the call)
 16. Adjourn
-

0. Welcome

AS welcomed the attendees.

1. Roll Call

SG performed the roll call and declared quorum. She noted that GV, NRO Executive Secretary, was on vacation and that APNIC staff member SC was assisting the Secretariat during the call.

2. Agenda Review

BJ asked to give an update on ICANN NomCom activities during AOB.

3. Approval of Minutes

a) November 2018

SG noted that the minutes had been amended according to HC's comments.

BJ proposed the motion to approve the minutes from the November 2018 ASO AC Teleconference. HC seconded the motion. There were no objections. AS asked the Secretariat to publish the minutes on the ASO AC website.

4. Open Actions

- **ACTION ITEM 181107-01: AS to forward the text relating to Recommendations #6 and #7 (gPDP) to the NRO EC after a seven-day comment period > CLOSED.**

AS noted that this text had been shared with the NRO EC, who had responded that it would be reviewed in the upcoming NRO EC meeting on 18 December.

- **ACTION ITEM 181107-02: AS to forward the text relating to Recommendations #9 and #10 (Chair and Vice Chair roles) to the NRO EC after a seven-day comment period > CLOSED: replaced by NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-01.**

AS noted that further changes to the text had been suggested by JS since the previous teleconference on 5 November and that the ASO AC would need to agree on these changes before the text could be sent to the NRO EC for approval. The suggested changes did not change the intent of the text. He added that the NRO EC would need time to review the text before their upcoming meeting on 18 December.

JS gave an overview of his suggested edits, which were mostly editorial. He noted that, as the text had been on the list for some time and that only one line of text regarding fractional terms was a change to procedure, he would be comfortable moving forward with this document and approving the changes during this teleconference.

He continued that, while he had not made any suggested edits to the text relating to the ASO AC Chair election procedure, the ASO AC should discuss this part of the text. In the past there had been issues with runoffs and he suggested that the ASO AC could consider using the Schultz Method for the ASO AC Chair elections in future.

KB suggested that the election procedures should not be changed right now: the voting group was small and introducing new procedures for elections would be complicated and might hold up the approval of the text.

NN agreed with KB but understood JS's point. She noted that the ASO AC had had many discussions about elections but mostly in relation to ICANN Board Seat candidate elections, which were more sensitive and political in nature than internal ones. The ASO AC had the duty to the public to ensure that ICANN Board Seat elections were carried out responsibly. She added that she didn't think that the same level of bureaucracy was necessary for internal ASO AC elections and that there was no urgency to adjust the voting procedure currently.

JS agreed.

There was discussion on whether the ASO AC could vote to accept the proposed changes to the ASO AC Operating Procedures on the call or whether a seven-day comment period on the mailing list would need to be held.

“...Operating Procedures may be amended at any regular or special meeting of the council or through an electronic vote. The proposed amendment must receive four-fifths majority support of all members of the Address Council whether at a council meeting or via an electronic vote. Electronic votes will be a minimum of 7 days, but can be concluded as soon as all members of the Address Council register a vote. All amendments to these Operating Procedures shall be approved by the Executive Council of the Number Resource Organization. Proposed amended text must be available for discussion on email for seven days prior to the start of a vote unless all Address Council members are available for a discussion of the amendment...”

AS noted that four-fifths of the ASO AC was currently on the call so a roll-call vote could be conducted.

KB proposed the motion to approve the ASO AC Procedures as circulated with the proposed changes submitted by JS and send to the NRO EC for review. BJ seconded the motion. There was further discussion on this and the ASO AC decided on a different course of action as noted below. The motion was therefore dismissed.

JS stated that while the full text had been on the list since 5 November, the editorial changes and newly added text regarding fractional terms had been on the list for only six days.

NN noted that the ASO AC could not vote to accept this text, as it had not spent the required seven days on the mailing list. She stressed that it needed to be clear that the ASO AC was voting to change its procedures and was not simply voting to send this text to the NRO EC for approval.

FY noted that she would not be comfortable voting on the proposed changes during the call. The vote request was unexpected and due to unforeseen circumstances she was taking the call on the road and couldn't assess the proposed new changes to the text properly.

There was further discussion on how and when the ASO AC would vote on these changes. The ASO AC ultimately agreed that the text would be sent to the mailing list on 5 December for a seven-day comment period and an e-vote would be conducted at the end of that seven-day period on 12 December.

NN noted that she did not disagree with the proposed changes but commented that having the text that is to be voted on in a Google doc might not be the most conducive, inclusive and transparent way of moving text to approval. It might not be clear to everyone that the text in the document was what the ASO AC would be voting on. The final proposed text should be sent to the mailing list.

LL agreed with NN and noted that the mailing list is the official method of communication.

NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-01: AS to send final proposed text regarding Recommendations #9 and #10 (Chair and Vice Chair roles) to the mailing list on 5 December for a seven-day comment period.

NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-02: ALL to review the final proposed text regarding Recommendations #9 and #10 (Chair and Vice Chair roles) and be ready to vote at the end of the seven-day comment period (12 December 2018).

- **ACTION ITEM 181107-03: ALL to review the proposed changes to the ASO mailing lists (Recommendation #16) with a view to approve after a seven-day comment period > CLOSED: replaced by NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-03.**

AS noted that the proposed changes to the ASO mailing lists had been circulated for more than seven days.

JS clarified that there would be no procedural changes as a result of these proposed changes.

AS noted that some of the names of the mailing lists would change and new lists would be created. He suggested that Recommendation #16 be sent to the mailing list for a seven-day comment period alongside Recommendations #9, #10 and #15.

There were no objections.

NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-03: AS to send final proposed text regarding Recommendations #16 (Changes to ASO mailing lists) to the mailing list on 5 December for a seven-day comment period.

NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-04: ALL to review the final proposed text regarding Recommendations #16 (Changes to ASO mailing lists) and be ready to vote at the end of the seven-day comment period (12 December 2018).

- **ACTION ITEM 181107-04: HC to draft the 2018 Work Plan Activity Review and circulate before the December ASO AC Teleconference > CLOSED**

HC noted he had shared the 2018 Work Plan Activity Review on the mailing list. Some questions and suggestions had been received and some amendments needed to be made.

NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-05: HC to further edit the 2018 Work Plan Activity Review and recirculate to the mailing list.

- **ACTION ITEM 181107-05: ALL to review the 2019 ASO AC Work Plan and provide input before the December ASO AC Teleconference > CLOSED.**

BJ noted that although he volunteered to help draft the 2019 ASO AC Work Plan, LL had completed most of the work on this action item.

LL went through the 2019 ASO AC Work Plan and gave an overview of the proposed new/edited work items.

NN noted that, during the previous teleconference, KB had raised the issue of personal details (resumes, bios, CVs) of ICANN Board Seat candidates on the ASO website. She asked if was something that should be noted in the 2019 ASO AC Work Plan to ensure that only relevant details were being published and that there was a defined process to remove data if that's what the ASO AC agreed upon.

AS noted that the Secretariat had made some recommendations on this (see ACTION ITEM 181107-07) and a work item could be added to the Work Plan at a later date if necessary.

NN noted that the Secretariat had audited the personal data currently on the site. However, the ASO AC might need to define a process to deal with the data gathered from future candidates to ensure that all personal data is eliminated and that someone is responsible for keeping an eye on this.

NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-06: LL to finalize the 2019 ASO AC Work Plan and re-circulate to the mailing list before the next ASO AC Teleconference (9 Jan 2019).

NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-07: ALL to review the second draft of the 2019 ASO AC Work Plan and be ready to finalize during the next ASO AC Teleconference (9 Jan 2019).

- **ACTION ITEM 181107-06: AS, KB and RP to draft the Annual Transparency Review and circulate before the December ASO AC Teleconference > OPEN.**

AS apologized for the delay in sending this document and that he would circulate it to the list within 24 hours.

- **ACTION ITEM 181107-07: Secretariat to provide an overview of the personal data currently on aso.icann.org website > CLOSED**

SG noted that she had audited the aso.icann.org website and had circulated a list of the pages with personal data on them. For transparency reasons, each ICANN Board Seat candidate's page must be kept online because of the comments of support. She suggested that, once an election period was over, all bios were removed and text noting that personal data had been removed but the comments relating to the candidate were still available could be added.

KB noted that it was a good idea to document that that personal data had been removed rather than simply leaving a blank page.

AS noted that there was an issue because of GDPR: personal information was collected and published so consent must be sought from ICANN Board Seat candidates. Candidates needed to be informed that their data would be published for x number of days and then removed. He added that there was currently no process for this.

NN asked for clarification on whether the entire bio would be removed or just the identifying data. She thought that if someone applied for a position on the ICANN Board they should agree to submit a bio, have it published on the website and then kept there with personal details removed.

SG noted that the suggestion was to remove the entire bio: there were many obsolete pages on the website and permission to leave personal details online had not been sought. She added that there was also an issue of what constitutes personal data.

KB noted that aside from GDPR, the ASO AC should have its own standard for privacy and data retention and there should be a consistent policy on this. He added that changes that impact transparency shouldn't be made to the ASO website without more discussion and a clear policy in place. Once an election is over, there was no real need to keep an unsuccessful candidate's data. He asked if transparency was more important than a person's privacy. He noted that before information was purged, the ASO AC should come up with clear guidelines on what data is needed and why.

NN agreed with KB. The ASO AC should proceed carefully as privacy is important but so is transparency. She added that GDPR is a separate issue to how the ASO handles personal data: GDPR applies to whatever data the Secretariat collects, whether it was published on the website or not. She added that the two other items to be considered were how the ASO AC handles the data already on the website and how to put a procedure in place to handle the collection of data in the future.

SG added that as the ASO website is hosted on the RIPE NCC's servers, the Secretariat had already contacted the RIPE NCC's legal team regarding the site's GDPR compliance.

AS asked that further discussion on this takes place on the mailing list.

- **ACTION ITEM 181107-08: GV to circulate the list of dates for the 2019 teleconferences. > CLOSED.**

AS noted that GV had sent the proposed list of dates to the mailing list on 14 December.

After discussion, the ASO AC agreed to move the 1 May meeting to 15 May due to it falling during the LACNIC meeting week.

The ASO AC also agreed to hold a preparatory meeting on 6 March for the ICANN 64 F2F session.

Teleconference Dates 2019:

- 9 January
- 6 February
- 6 March (*ICANN 64 preparatory meeting: not formally minuted*)
- 9 - 14 March (F2F Meeting expected to take place between 9 - 14 March in Kobe, Japan at ICANN 64)
- 3 April
- 15 May (*Moved from 1 May due to LACNIC Meeting*)
- 5 June
- 3 July
- 7 August
- 4 September
- 2 October
- 13 November
- 4 December

AS noted that as of 2019, the teleconferences would begin at 12:00 PM UTC.

NN asked for clarification about the time change: does the time shift address the concerns noted by the ASO AC member who asked for this to be looked into?

KB noted that the Secretariat had sent an in-depth report to the ASO AC regarding members' time zones, which confirmed that any major shift would negatively impact several members. The original concern was not addressed by this time shift, but the one-hour change does help a small number of people located on the US west coast.

NN wondered why the time was being changed if it did not address the original complaint. Those located on the US west coast had noted in the past that the schedule was not a problem and this time shift might make things harder for those located in Australia.

KB noted that the individual member who raised the concern did not comment further on the issue. He noted that during discussion on this, those who might be affected by the one-hour time change did not raise any objections.

AS reminded the ASO AC that there was a provision in the ASO AC Operating Procedures that enables a region to ask for a teleconference to be rescheduled if all three representatives were unable to attend a scheduled meeting.

BJ proposed the motion to accept the dates noted above for the 2019 Teleconference Schedule. KB seconded the motion. There were no objections. Motion carried.

- **ACTION ITEM 181107-09: All – Each region to select a representative for the ICANN 64 ASO Public Session Planning Team by 17 November 2018 > CLOSED.**

OA, KB, AS, RP/JV and HC volunteered to join the ICANN 64 ASO Public Session Planning Team.

- **ACTION ITEM 181107-10: Secretariat to check that the Seat 10 announcement was circulated to the relevant lists in each region and request that RIR staff circulate a reminder > *CLOSED*.**

SG noted that she had sent an overview of all announcements sent and tweets distributed to the mailing list. All five RIRs had announced Seat 10 Elections to their communities.

5. ASO Review Recommendations 6,7,9 and 10 Status Update

This item was discussed during agenda item 4. Open Action Items.

6. ASO new mailing list implementation plan (Recommendation 16)

This item was discussed during agenda item 4. Open Action Items.

7. 2018 Work Plan Activity Review

This item was discussed during agenda item 4. Open Action Items.

8. 2019 ASO AC Work Plan

This item was discussed during agenda item 4. Open Action Items.

9. Annual Transparency Review

This item was discussed during agenda item 4. Open Action Items.

10. ASO AC Chair Election Schedule.

AS noted that the ASO AC Chair Election nomination period had opened on 1 December and would close on 31 December 2018.

The ASO AC discussed the ASO AC Chair Election schedule.

JS proposed the motion to hold the ASO AC Chair Election Schedule from 1 – 5 January. BJ seconded the motion. There were no objections. Motion carried.

11. 2019 ASO AC Teleconference Schedule

This item was discussed during agenda item 4. Open Action Items.

12. 2018 ASO AC Appointments Review

SG noted that she had shared an overview of the appointments with the ASO AC Chair/Co-Chairs.

AS noted that he would forward the list of ASO AC appointments to the mailing list.

NEW ACTION ITEM 181205-08: AS to send the list of ASO AC Appointments to the mailing list.

13. Personal Data on ASO website

This item was discussed during agenda item 4. Open Action Items.

14. Reports

a) AFRINIC Meeting

NM noted that he and the other ASO AC attendees were unable to attend the AFRINIC Meeting. HC, who attended, gave a brief report of relevant discussions during the event. He noted that the AFRINIC community had been asked to complete a survey on the ASO Consultations.

NM added that a second round of discussion on the ASO Consultation was being conducted. He noted that a survey was underway and would conclude mid-December. He would report back to the ASO AC with any feedback.

15. AOB

a) ICANN Board Election Status Update (No ICANN Board members in the call)

AS asked all observers to leave the call.

SG confirmed that all observers had disconnected and that only the ASO AC members and the ASO/NRO Secretariat remained on the call.

The ASO AC discussed the upcoming elections for ICANN Board Seat 10.

b) ICANN NomCom Update

BJ noted that he had sent a presentation on NomCom Activities 2019 to the mailing list and encouraged the ASO AC members to read it and, as a member of the community, share details with their respective communities.

c) Thanks to Ex-ASO AC Member

RP noted that HG had stepped down from the ASO AC and his expressed appreciation for his 20 years of support and hard work.

On behalf of the ASO AC, AS thanked HG for his long contribution and for everything he had done for the ASO AC as an ASO AC member. He added that HG had done an outstanding job representing the LACNIC community.

16. Adjourn

JS proposed the motion to adjourn. KB and BJ seconded the motion. There were no objections. The meeting ended at 13.52 UTC.